# JULY 1, 2022 ACTUARIAL VALUATION OF THE CITY OF CRANSTON FIRE AND POLICE DEPARTMENT PENSION PLANS



# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

REPORT SUMMARY	<u>Page</u>
Highlights	1
Introduction	2
ELINDED CTATUC AND ADDRODDIATIONS	
FUNDED STATUS AND APPROPRIATIONS	2
Market Value of Plan Assets	3
Results	4
Appropriation Forecast	5
EXHIBITS	
1 Age/Service Distribution with Salary	7
2 Retiree Distribution	8
3 Cashflow Forecast	9
4 Summary of Plan Provisions	10
5 Actuarial Methods and Assumptions	13
6 Glossary of Terms	17
CERTIFICATION	19

<u>hlights</u>	July 1, 2021	<u>July 1, 2022</u>
Contributions		
Funding Schedule FY 2022	\$20,827,416	
Funding Schedule FY 2023		\$21,288,325
Funded Ratios		
Attained Age Method	27.2%	24.4%
Participants		
Actives	9	8
Retirees and Beneficiaries	<u>412</u>	<u>401</u>
Total	421	409
<u>Payroll</u>		
Payroll of Active Members	\$1,266,219	\$1,189,091
Average Payroll	140,691	148,636
Present Value of Future Benefits		
Actives	12,396,231	11,782,987
Retirees, Beneficiaries, Disabilities and Inactives	<u>287,257,712</u>	274,407,707
Total	299,653,943	286,190,694
Actuarial Value of Assets		
Market Value of Assets without receivable	81,407,673	69,572,808
Market Value of Assets with receivable*	102,940,146	90,400,224
Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liabilities	\$217,346,987	\$215,833,860

<sup>\*</sup> The contribution receivable is the city FYE23 budgeted amount of \$20,827,416.

# **Introduction**

The purpose of this report is to present the findings of an actuarial valuation as of July 1, 2022, of the City of Cranston Fire and Police Department Pension Plans for the purpose of funding the plan. Separate report was prepared for accounting and financial disclosure purposes.

The actuarial valuation is based on:

- Negotiated provisions with the Fire and Police unions as of July 1, 2022.
- Employee data provided by the City
- Asset information reported by the City of Cranston

During the last twelve months, the total unfunded actuarial accrued liability decreased by 0.79% to \$215,833,860. The decrease is less than expected. There was an actuarial loss of \$3,526,511. Sources of (gains) and losses are as follows:

	( <u>Gain</u> ) / <u>Loss</u>
Assets	14,543,596
Active - Retirements	(1,690,932)
Active - Terminations	-
Active - Mortality	2,134
Active - Disabilities	(23,577)
New Entrants	-
Salary	147,293
Inactive - Mortality and data adjustments	(9,970,878)
Benefit Payments	519,073
Other	(198)
Total (Gain) / Loss	3,526,511

# **Market Value of Plan Assets**

The trust fund composition on a market value basis is shown below.

	<u>July 1, 2022</u>	<u>July 1, 2021</u>
Cash equivalents	\$532,311	\$713,315
PIMCO Bond Account	7,363,350	6
JMS Other Investments (REIT)	0	0
Janney Equitites Stock/Options	43,080,782	54,374,441
Janney-Fx Inc Mutual Fund	12,080,092	21,650,212
JMS Taxable Dividends	1,246,604	2,219,442
JMS Account	5,269,668	2,450,257
Total Market Value	69,572,808	81,407,673
Contribution Receivable	<u>20,827,416</u>	20,827,416
Total Actuarial Value	\$90,400,224	\$102,235,089

# **Results of the Valuation**

1. Actuarial Liabilities		<u>Fire</u>	<u>Police</u>	<u>Total</u>
(a)	PVFB Actives	7,542,469	4,240,518	11,782,987
(b)	PVFB Retirees	162,590,500	111,817,207	274,407,707
(c)	Total	170,132,969	116,057,725	286,190,694
2. Market Value	e of Assets	43,792,739	25,780,068	69,572,808
3. Total Future	Contributions	126,340,230	90,277,657	216,617,886
4. Unfunded Ac	crued Liability	125,864,771	89,969,090	215,833,860
5. Present Value	e of Future Normal Contributions	475,459	308,567	784,026
6. Present Value	e of Future Salary	2,495,864	1,602,229	4,098,093
7. Normal Contr	ribution Rate	19.05%	19.26%	19.13%
8. Valuation Pa	yroll	761,695	427,396	1,189,091
9. Normal Cost with Interest				
(a) Empl	oyees	98,707	52,749	151,456
(b) City		52,018	32,751	84,769
(c) Total	l (7. x 8.), plus interest	150,725	85,500	236,225
10. Asset Recei	vable	11,905,687	8,921,729	20,827,416
11. Adjusted UA	AL for FYE24	128,239,677	91,216,541	219,456,218
12. City Contrib	oution to Amortize			
•	Approved FYE42	11,643,719	5,638,488	17,282,207
	Outs FYE37	673,457	3,247,892	3,921,350
(c) Total		12,317,176	8,886,380	21,203,556
13. Total Contri	ibution	12,467,901	8,971,880	21,439,781
14. City Contrib	oution FYE24	12,369,194	8,919,131	21,288,325

Due to different amortization period for the retirees that opted out of the Court approved agreement, Market Value of Assets were allocated in proportion of each group's accrued liability to the total accrued liability.

# **Appropriation Forecast**

The following exhibit forecasts employer and employee contributions over the next 21 years under the adopted funding schedule.

Fiscal		Normal	Court				
Year		Cost with	Approved	Other	Total Cost	Unfunded	Funded
<b>Ending</b>	<u>Payroll</u>	<u>Interest</u>	Amortizatioin	<b>Amortization</b>	with Interest	<u>Liability</u>	Ratio %**
2023	\$1,000,797	\$219,815	\$17,740,139	\$3,550,472	\$20,827,416	\$215,833,860	24.4%
2024	\$836,686	\$184,360	\$17,282,207	\$3,921,350	\$21,261,296	\$211,269,678	25.4%
2025	\$705,085	\$155,891	\$17,282,207	\$3,999,777	\$21,310,240	\$205,934,804	26.6%
2026	\$528,430	\$117,208	\$17,282,207	\$4,079,772	\$21,365,677	\$200,097,010	27.9%
2027	\$387,950	\$86,280	\$17,282,207	\$4,161,367	\$21,418,661	\$193,714,935	29.2%
2028	\$320,172	\$71,903	\$17,282,207	\$4,244,595	\$21,473,709	\$186,743,918	30.7%
2029	\$240,947	\$55,280	\$17,282,207	\$4,329,487	\$21,552,994	\$179,135,739	32.3%
2030	\$159,164	\$37,831	\$17,282,207	\$4,416,076	\$21,636,065	\$170,838,332	34.0%
2031	\$77,586	\$18,634	\$17,282,207	\$4,504,398	\$21,731,409	\$161,795,486	36.0%
2032	\$27,056	\$6,498	\$17,282,207	\$4,594,486	\$21,830,374	\$151,946,510	38.3%
2033	\$21,814	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$4,686,376	\$21,846,470	\$141,225,886	40.9%
2034	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$4,780,103	\$22,062,310	\$129,562,883	44.0%
2035	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$4,875,705	\$22,157,912	\$116,881,143	47.7%
2036	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$4,973,219	\$22,255,426	\$103,098,239	52.0%
2037	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$5,072,684	\$22,354,890	\$88,125,193	57.2%
2038	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$71,865,958	63.5%
2039	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$59,591,490	68.2%
2040	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$46,347,339	73.9%
2041	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$32,056,899	80.9%
2042	\$0	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$0	\$17,282,207	\$16,637,515	89.5%
2043	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	100.0%

# **EXHIBITS**

Exhibit 1 - Age/Service Distribution with Salary as of July 1, 2022

Attained	Service				
Age	25-29	30-34	35-39	40+	Total
C					
< 20	0	0	0	0	0
< 20	0	0	0	0	0
	U	U	U	U	U
20-24	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
25-29	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
20.24	0	0	0	0	0
30-34	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
35-39	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
40-44	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
45-49	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
50-54	0	1	0	0	1
30-34	0	89,542	0	0	89,542
	O .	09,342	U	U	07,542
55-59	0	2	2	2	6
	0	101,401	128,140	149,178	126,240
60-64	0	0	1	0	1
	0	0	124,666	0	124,666
	_	-	,		,
65-69	0	0	0	0	0
	0	0	0	0	0
70+	0	0	0	0	0
. •	0	0	0	0	0
	v	v	O .	· ·	Ü
Total Employees	0	3	3	2	8
Average Salary	0	97,448	126,982	149,178	121,456

Exhibit 2 - Retiree Distribution as of July 1, 2022

	Number	of Employ	/ees	Total M	Ionthly Paym	ents	
Attained Age	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	
< 20	0	0	0	0	0	0	
20-24	0	0	0	0	0	0	
25-29	0	0	0	0	0	0	
30-34	0	0	0	0	0	0	
35-39	0	0	0	0	0	0	
40-44	0	0	0	0	0	0	
45-49	0	0	0	0	0	0	
50-54	1	1	2	1,237	6,403	7,639	
55-59	8	31	39	19,435	111,655	131,090	
60-64	11	80	91	29,272	380,027	409,299	
65-69	11	59	70	34,415	282,815	317,230	
70-74	13	58	71	34,702	276,261	310,963	
75-79	18	42	60	59,419	192,968	252,386	
80-84	10	22	32	42,649	99,821	142,470	
85-89	13	9	22	43,671	43,735	87,406	
90-94	6	6	12	16,793	24,555	41,348	
95+	2	0	2	4,358	0	4,358	
otal	93	308	401	285,951	1,418,239	1,704,190	
verage (Age/Payment)	75.42	69.48	70.86	3,075	4,605	4,250	
requency Percent	23.2	76.8	100	16.8	83.2	100	

# **Exhibit 3 - Cash Flow**

The following is a forecast of benefit payments, contribution income and investment returns.

	Plan Year	Benefit	Employee	Employer	Investment	Plan Assets -
_	Ending	Payments	Contributions	Contributions	Returns	BOY
	2022	\$24,960,536	\$161,520	\$21,532,473	\$14,829,958	\$81,407,673
	2023	24,981,737	136,397	20,799,271	6,274,424	83,636,027
	2024	24,939,739	114,033	20,842,509	6,452,900	86,105,731
	2025	25,316,019	96,140	20,891,112	6,634,616	88,411,580
	2026	25,635,015	73,240	20,947,909	6,805,731	90,603,445
	2027	25,860,491	54,036	21,002,209	6,971,511	92,770,710
	2028	26,059,423	44,635	21,054,767	7,136,689	94,947,378
	2029	26,233,965	33,464	21,133,276	7,304,492	97,184,645
	2030	26,343,213	19,805	21,221,970	7,479,910	99,563,117
	2031	26,388,434	10,146	21,304,601	7,668,885	102,158,314
	2032	26,350,146	3,624	21,405,885	7,879,061	105,096,738
	2033	26,272,828	2,922	21,415,915	8,114,554	108,357,301
	2034	26,122,947	0	21,636,210	8,386,369	112,256,933
	2035	25,913,783	0	21,728,081	8,706,105	116,777,336
	2036	25,641,898	0	21,821,790	9,077,383	122,034,612
	2037	25,305,065	0	21,917,373	9,509,464	128,156,384
	2038	24,899,979	0	17,042,636	9,819,888	130,118,929
	2039	24,425,864	0	17,042,636	9,993,301	132,729,002
	2040	23,881,730	0	17,042,636	10,220,581	136,110,489
	2041	23,265,950	0	17,042,636	10,511,580	140,398,754
	2042	22,579,993	0	17,042,636	10,876,933	145,738,330

# **EXHIBIT 4 - SUMMARY OF PLAN PROVISIONS:**

This summary is prepared in accordance with Fire and Police union contracts as of July 1, 2022, and does not take into account any subsequent changes.

#### 1. Administration

The Pension Plan is administered by the City of Cranston.

#### 2. Participation

Participation is mandatory for all full-time employees whose employment began prior to July 1, 1995.

## 3. Salary

Salary is defined as regular compensation plus Holiday Pay and Longevity. Salary <u>does not</u> include bonuses, overtime, severance pay, unused sick leave credit or other similar compensation.

# 4. Member Contributions

Member contributions vary depending upon their employment as follows:

#### **Member Contribution Rate**

Firefighters 10.5% of Salary Police 10.0% of Salary

# 5. Average Salary

Final salary is used to determine a participant's benefit.

#### 6. <u>Creditable Service</u>

In general, creditable service is awarded during the period in which a member contributes to the retirement system.  $https://shermanactuary-my.sharepoint.com/personal/dan\_shermanactuary\_com/Documents/Recovered Data/Cranston/Pension 2022/Cranston21.docx and the contract of the contract of$ 

# 7. Service Retirement

## a. Eligibility:

Completion of 20 years of service

#### b. Benefit Amount:

A pension of 2½% of the member's final salary for each year of service up to 20 years plus 2% of final salary for each year of service, up to 10 years, in excess of 20 years. An additional 5% of final compensation is added to the pension at age 55.

# 8. <u>Deferred Vested Retirement</u>

#### a. <u>Eligibility</u>:

A participant who has completed 10 or more years of creditable service is eligible for a deferred vested retirement benefit.

#### b. Benefit Amount:

The participant's accrued benefit is based on 2.5% per year of credited service up to 20 years, plus 2% per year (up to 10 years).

#### b. Refund of Contributions:

In lieu of the deferred pension benefit, a member may elect to receive a refund of their accumulated contributions with credited interest.

# 9. Accidental Disability

#### a. Eligibility:

Participants are eligible for an accidental disability benefit, regardless of service or age, if they become permanently and totally incapacitated for further duty as a result of personal injury sustained while in the performance of duties.

#### b. Benefit Amount:

The accidental disability amount is 66 2/3rd% of annual salary.

 $https://shermanactuary-my.sharepoint.com/personal/dan\_shermanactuary\_com/Documents/Recovered Data/Cranston/Pension 2022/Cranston21.docx and the contract of the contract of$ 

# 10. Ordinary Disability

#### a. <u>Eligibility</u>:

An ordinary disability occurs when a member becomes permanently and totally disabled due to sickness or injury that is not job related.

## b. Benefit Amount:

The ordinary disability amount is 50% of the final salary.

#### 11. Survivor Benefits

#### a. Eligibility:

Death in active service after 1 year of service or after termination with a deferred pension. (No service requirement if death is work related).

## b. Benefit Amount:

A pension of 331/3% of the member's final compensation is paid to his widow until she dies or remarries. The benefit increases to 67½% of final compensation if the member has 20 years of service. (The pension is 50% if death is work related). In the event of death after termination with a deferred pension, the widow receives 67½% of the deferred pension starting when the member would have been age 55.

# 12. Cost-of-Living Increases

For Court approved members, every other year COLA freeze for a ten year period, effective July 1, 2013. In years 11 and 12 a 1.5% COLA would apply and then a 3.0% COLA for each year thereafter. For others, No COLAs will be paid for a ten year period effective July 1, 2013. Upon the expiration of the ten year period, 3.0% annually thereafter, effective each July 1st.

#### 13. Postretirement Death Benefits

Any benefits following the death of a member after retirement are based upon the 66.5% Joint and Survivor Annuity form of benefit.

# **EXHIBIT 5 - ACTUARIAL METHODS AND ASSUMPTIONS:**

The actuarial cost method, factors and assumptions used in determining cost estimates are presented below.

## 1. Member Data

The member data used in the determination of cost estimates consist of pertinent information with respect to the active, inactive, retired and disabled members of the employer as supplied by the employer to the actuary.

## 2. Valuation Date

July 1, 2022.

# 3. Actuarial Cost Method

Attained Age Normal method with the UAAL funded on a closed period. For the Court approved plan provisions, the closed period is through FYE 2042. For the Opt Out plan the closed period is through FYE 2037. Amortization of the approved plan provisions is level dollar. The amortization of the Opt Out liability is increasing payments at 2% per year.

# 4. Rate of Investment Return

It is assumed that the assets of the fund will accumulate at a compound annual rate of 7.9% per annum, net of investment management fees.

#### 5. <u>Cost-of-Living Increases</u>

For Court approved members, every other year COLA freeze for a ten year period, effective July 1, 2013. In years 11 and 12 a 1.5% COLA would apply and then a 3.0% COLA for each year thereafter. For others, No COLAs will be paid for a ten year period effective July 1, 2013. Upon the expiration of the ten year period, 3.0% annually thereafter, effective each July 1st.

#### 6. Salary Scale

The assumed annual rates for salary increases including longevity and holiday pay is 3%.

 $https://shermanactuary-my.sharepoint.com/personal/dan\_shermanactuary\_com/Documents/Recovered Data/Cranston/Pension 2022/Cranston21.docx and the contract of the contract of$ 

# 7. Value of Investments

Assets held by the fund are valued at market value as reported by the City. The actuarial value of assets is equal to the market value.

## 8. Annual Rate of Withdrawal Prior to Retirement

None

#### 9. Annual Rate of Mortality

It is assumed that pre-retirement mortality is represented by the RP-2000 Blue Collar mortality table with Scale AA improvement to 2026. Post retirement mortality is represented by the RP-2000 White Collar Mortality Table, adjusted 115% for males, 95% for females, with Scale AA improvements on a generational basis. Mortality for disabled members is represented by the RP-2000 Blue Collar Mortality Table with Scale AA adjustment to 2026 and a setforward of 3 years.

# 10. Service Retirement

Based on expected experience, the assumed annual retirement rates are illustrated at the following ages and years of service. It is assumed that retirement will take place at age 65, regardless of service.

<b>Service</b>	Rate
20	0.20
21	0.04
22	0.04
23	0.04
24	0.04
25	0.15
26	0.10
27	0.10
28	0.10
29	0.05
30	0.20

# 11. Annual Rate of Disability Prior to Retirement

Based on an analysis of experience, the assumed annual rates of disability may best be illustrated by the following rates at the following ages:

Attained Age	
20	0.0012
30	0.0022
40	0.0044
50	0.0121

In addition, it is assumed for the 7.5% of all disabilities are assumed to be ordinary and 92.5% are service connected.

# 12. Family Composition

It is assumed that 80% of all male members and 80% of all female members will be survived by a spouse and that females (males) are three years younger (older) than members.

# 13. Administrative Expenses

No provisions are made for administrative expenses.

# 14. <u>Definition of Salary</u>

Regular pay plus a 20.04% holiday/longevity load (8.14% for holiday and 11% for longevity).

 $https://shermanactuary-my.sharepoint.com/personal/dan\_shermanactuary\_com/Documents/Recovered Data/Cranston/Pension 2022/Cranston21.docx and the contract of the contract of$ 

# **EXHIBIT 6 - GLOSSARY OF TERMS:**

This glossary summarizes the technical terms contained in this report.

#### 1. Actuarial Accrued Liability

That portion of the Actuarial Present Value of plan benefits that is not provided for by future employer Normal Costs or employee contributions.

#### 2. Actuarial Assumptions

Assumptions as to the occurrence of future events affecting the Pension Plan such as:

- Rates of investment returns
- Increases in a member's salary
- Inflation
- The probability of mortality, turnover, disablement
- Retirement at each age and other relevant items

#### 3. Actuarial Cost Method

A procedure for allocating the Actuarial Present Value of pension plan benefits between Normal Cost and Actuarial Accrued Liability.

# 4. Actuarial Present Value

The single sum amount required at the valuation date that is required to provide for anticipated future events based upon the terms of the plan and the Actuarial Assumptions.

#### 5. Forecast

A projection of future benefit payments or contribution requirements based upon the terms of the plan, the current asset amounts, the Actuarial Assumptions and additional assumptions as to the replacement of terminating employees with new employees.

## 6. Normal Cost

That portion of the Actuarial Present Value of future benefits that is assigned to the current year.

# 7. <u>Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability</u>

That portion of the Actuarial Accrued Liability that is not provided for by current actuarial value of assets.

# 8. Valuation Method

The method used to divide the cost of future benefits among the Actuarial Accrued Liability, the current year's Normal Costs and future years' Normal Costs. The resulting current funding requirement is then determined as the current year's Normal Cost plus the payment necessary to amortize the Unfunded Actuarial Liability.

# 9. Vested Liability

That portion of the Actuarial Present Value of Accrued Benefits that a member would be entitled to if the member terminated employment with the employer as of the valuation date.

 $https://shermanactuary-my.sharepoint.com/personal/dan\_shermanactuary\_com/Documents/Recovered\ Data/Cranston/Pension\ 2022/Cranston21.docx/pension2022/Cranston2022$ 

# **CERTIFICATION:**

This report fairly represents the actuarial position of the City of Cranston Fire and Police Department Pension Plans contributing as of July 1, 2022, in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles applied consistently with the preceding valuation. In our opinion, the actuarial assumptions used to compute actuarial accrued liability and normal cost are reasonably related to plan experience and to reasonable expectations, and represents our best estimate of anticipated plan experience.

The funded status measure is appropriate for assessing the sufficiency of plan assets to cover the estimated cost of settling the plan's benefit obligations. The funded status measure is appropriate for assessing the need for or the amount of future contributions. The funded status measure would be different if the measure reflected the market value of assets rather than the actuarial value of assets.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions; changes in economic or demographic assumptions; increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the plan's funded status); and changes in plan provisions or applicable law. Due to the limited scope of our assignment, we did not perform an analysis of the potential range of such future measurements.

The report was prepared under the supervision of Daniel Sherman, an Associate of the Society of Actuaries and a Member of the American Academy of Actuaries, who takes responsibility for the overall appropriateness of the analysis, assumptions and results. Daniel Sherman is deemed to meet the General Qualification Standard and the basic education and experience requirement in the pension area. Based on over thirty years of performing valuations of similar complexity, Mr. Sherman is qualified by experience. Daniel Sherman has met the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein.

Sherman Actuarial Services, LLC

Daniel W. Therman

Daniel W. Sherman, ASA, MAAA

September, 2022